

Overcoming exclusion in education

Yusuf Sayed

The statistics on global illiteracy and children out of school are a stark reminder that Education for All (EFA) is clearly *not for all*. Those who are out of school are in most societies the most marginalized and disadvantaged, the hard and hardest to reach. With 101 million children out of school worldwide, if Education for All is to be achieved by 2015, then the education rights and needs of those excluded must become paramount. This chapter reviews the challenges that minorities and indigenous peoples face in education and strategies to overcome them.

The marginalization of minorities and indigenous peoples: causes and effects

While the education needs of minorities and indigenous peoples are evident, it is clear, as this book notes, that the reality is one of discrimination, stigma and poor-quality education. Overcoming such factors is complex.

In the Philippines, for example, the Constitution provides that the state shall recognize, respect and protect the rights of indigenous cultural communities to preserve and develop their cultures, traditions and institutions, and that their rights shall be considered in the formulation of national plans and policies (Constitution, Section 17, Article IV). To give effect to this, the government has created various structures, one of which includes the National Commission on Indigenous Peoples (NCIP). In consultation with civil society groups, an Indigenous Peoples Core Curriculum based on an Alternative Learning System (ALS) was created. The curriculum uses the same competencies as the general curriculum but focuses on what is considered essential to indigenous peoples, and each indigenous group may decide either to adapt or modify it as they find the need to do so. However, while this may be a positive development, the lack of certification and equivalency has made it difficult for those in the ALS to be mainstreamed into formal education, as Caoli-Rodriguez notes in a background paper for the UNESCO EFA global monitoring report. Additionally, the danger is that the ALS is seen as a second-best separate education track for indigenous peoples. While some students have completed formal basic education and some have earned college degrees, most indigenous peoples are unserved and minimally reached by the ALS. Moreover, teaching approaches and methods, the curriculum, evaluation

tools and school management are seen as not being responsive to indigenous peoples' needs.

The marginalization of minorities is never the product of just a single factor. It is often the product of complex forces which affect individuals at particular points in their lives. While factors relating to income and livelihoods have been identified as the important economic causes of exclusion, the cultural and social factors that lead different groups to experience and value education differently are important explanatory factors. Table 1 draws from available research and provides a brief summary of some of the structural conditions which drive children into marginalization and its adverse effects. It is important to recognize that while the table presents these factors as analytically separate, they are often interrelated in reality.

Educational exclusion and marginalization of minorities and indigenous peoples are experienced and manifested in a number of ways, creating three sets of hurdles to be overcome. The first hurdle is ensuring physical access to education. Second, even when the excluded do have access to schools, they generally only have access to poorer-quality education. (see Care Study, p. 36). The quality of the educational experience has a crucial effect on the demand for and completion of primary education. Retention in primary schooling and progression to upper primary and secondary education will continue to decrease as it becomes clear that, for many, the school services that are provided do not meet their needs and are alienating and exclusionary. Jansen, writing about education change in South Africa after the ending of *Apartheid* notes how black students are excluded from entry to 'white' schools in the new South African dispensation. He found a hostile and cultural environment in which assumptions are fixed about what constitutes good schooling and appropriate language policy. Delpit writes about curricula for poor and black students in the USA and notes that in schools the worldviews of those with a privileged position are taken as the only reality, while most of the marginalized are ignored. These studies show that schools can be alienating and their ethos and institutional culture effectively exclude the marginalized.

The third hurdle comes once students leave education. It is crucial to focus on the outcomes for marginalized minorities and indigenous peoples. A focus on outcomes considers the labour market opportunities that the marginalized enjoy upon

Table 1 Structural conditions that marginalize children, and some of their effects

Structural conditions	Adverse effect
Conflict	Children often become mentally and physically disabled, orphans, refugees or internally displaced people as a consequence of wars or conflicts. In Uganda, 613,000 children, many of them from ethnic minorities, became orphans during the 1990s due to conflict. In Sierra Leone, it is estimated that during the eleven years of civil war there were nearly 48,000 child soldiers, a quarter of whom were girls. In Jordan and Syria, some 72,000 Iraqi children in refugee camps attend school with the help of UNHCR.
Disability	Disabled children have limited access to educational facilities, learning equipment, and teachers who are trained to teach them. This is particularly so in rural areas or urban slums in developing countries. There are an estimated 150 million children with disabilities in the world. In India, it is estimated that 4.3 per cent of children aged 6 to 13 out of school in 2005 were disabled.
Discrimination	Children from a marginalized ethnicity, religion, tribe or class often experience educational exclusion due to negative social attitudes, sometimes over a long period of history. In sub-Saharan Africa, only 13 per cent of children who receive primary education use their mother tongues. Lack of access to primary education in their mother tongues often makes it difficult for children to follow instructions. Batwa children in the Great Lakes Region of Africa continue to face widespread discrimination. Even when they have access to primary education, they suffer from verbal and sexual abuse and school curricula do not meet their needs.
Disease	Children who are affected or infected by HIV/AIDS and other diseases often become marginalized due to social stigma, poor health or increased costs for treatment. Those children are also more likely to become orphans with little or no protection from violence. In sub-Saharan Africa, it is estimated that the number of orphans whose parents died from AIDS increased from 6.5 million in 2001 to 11.6 million in 2007.
Family breakdown	Children often leave home due to family problems. These include: family crisis, unemployment, divorce, alcoholism and substance abuse weakening family ties. In Central and Eastern Europe, the Commonwealth of Independent States, and the Baltics, about 1.5 million children are in public care, an increase of 150,000 since 1989, due to problems relating to their families.
Location	Indigenous, rural or nomadic people often live in marginalized areas where access to basic facilities such as health care and education is limited. They are also less likely to be registered at birth and are more prone to poor health and low participation in education. Evidence from DfID-funded projects shows that 1 million Peruvians and 87 per cent of Bolivians living in indigenous and rural areas do not hold identity cards. This means that they have limited access to public health care and education, and are barred from political participation.
Poverty	Children work on the streets, in hazardous places, or as sex workers due to household poverty. Such children are at risk of mental, psychological, physical and sexual abuse. Worldwide, as many as 100 million children are estimated to be street children. Some estimates suggest that about 11,172 children live and work on the streets in Mexico City.

completing education and their social status. In many cases minorities are under-represented in key positions in society. For example, the UK civil service still struggles to recruit sufficient numbers of minority ethnic staff into senior positions – they are often clustered at the lower grades of employment. Universities in the UK are still not wholly representative of minority ethnic members in society.

Exclusion and inclusion in education: examples from South Africa and India

In a detailed study, we examined education inclusion and exclusion of race- and caste-based groups in India and South Africa, looking at the extent to which the government’s policy commitment to overcoming discrimination and marginalization was translated into practice at the school level, focusing on governance, curricula and teaching (Sayed, Y., Subrahmanian, R., Carrim, N. and Soudien, C., *Education Exclusion and Inclusion: Policy and Implementation in India and South Africa*, DfID, London, 2008).

Inhibiting access: governance processes and procedures

In South Africa it was clear that access and inclusion were regulated at all schools in the study, despite the welter of prescriptions by central government and in the South African Schools Act (SASA) about the state operating an open access system. Under the SASA, all children have the right to be admitted to school. However, even though schools were following the SASA, the study showed that the schools had very specific interpretations of the policy and used various strategies to exclude learners.

Language at schools was used as a consistent way of excluding parents and their children or limiting their rights. For example, at Ruby Primêr in South Africa one parent reported that her son had been demoted to a lower grade because he did not have an Afrikaans background: ‘There is nothing we could do because they said he could not understand Afrikaans.’

In this group of former House of Representatives (HOR) schools (for people classified ‘coloured’) and former House of Delegates (HOD) schools (for people classified ‘Indian’), the least open school was Amazon Secondary. The school had made a conscious decision to improve its matriculation results and so used learner admissions as a means of achiev-

ing this. Management believed that accepting large numbers of low-income learners from many different areas had contributed to the high attrition rate of learners. The majority of educators favoured the admission of learners from the local area only. In effect this meant a greater intake of ‘Indian’ learners. The reason given was that this would alleviate some of the problems experienced in the classroom in terms of the continuity of standards.

The charging and payment of school fees had a profound effect on the exclusion of the previously marginalized black majority. At Lagaan School, where school fees had increased from R120 in 2001 to R450 in 2002, parents reported feeling embarrassed about the fact that they did not pay school fees as they did not have the means. While they were not excluded, the fact that they did not pay led them to hold back in certain activities at the school. In the case of Eastdale School, parents had to ‘be able to afford it’ in order for their children to be part of the school. Many ‘African’ parents chose Eastdale based on the view that such schools offered a better quality education. In some ways, they wanted the school to remain an exclusive school. It was very much a school for the middle class and, moreover, a school for boys.

What this reveals is that while no schools were overtly discriminating on the basis of ‘race’, class or gender, in practice all of these factors were in use as schools introduced language tests through interviews and entrance examinations, consistently pushed up their fees to maintain what they thought were ‘good’ standards and presented themselves as bastions of one or other culture.

Curricula: language and exclusion

Formally, all the schools in South Africa taught the new mandated Curriculum 2005, which is a skills-based curriculum as opposed to a content-based one. While all the schools expressed and manifested a commitment to Curriculum 2005, language became a key way in which previously disadvantaged black learners experienced exclusion. Clear examples of the problem occurred at former ‘white’ schools such as Eastdale, Oasis and North City High, the former Department of Education and Training (DET) schools such as Basildon, and the former HOR and HOD schools such as Ruby and Lagaan. At Eastdale, the school adopted the attitude that parents wanted their children to learn



Left: On 4 February 2009, a girl sits alone at a desk during a lesson at Omar Ben al-Khattab School in the town of Beit Lahia, in the northern Gaza Strip. Behind her is a hole in the classroom's wall, made during Israel's recent military incursion. *Iyad El Baba/UNICEF.*

they came from homes where education was not valued. These views were expressed by almost all the teachers who were from upper-caste backgrounds. The effect was that they taught in ways which did not challenge or enrich the learning experiences of the marginalized and produced a view among Dalit and Adivasi students that they were not good learners, thus creating a vicious cycle of their exclusion from learning. In many cases the research found that in the classrooms teachers operated a direct prejudicial and discriminatory pedagogy. For example, in both the primary and middle schools in Harda, Korku students were asked to sweep the school and fetch registers, while the task of serving the teacher water was done by Muslim and Kahar (other lower-caste) children.

To overcome discrimination and alienation in the school and classroom settings, attention has to be paid to ensuring that:

- there are adequate financial and other incentives put in place to attract teachers to work in areas where minorities and indigenous peoples are located;
- there are incentives to attract more teachers from minorities into the teaching profession, overcoming current obstacles and barriers;
- there is better initial (and ongoing) teacher training and adequate support in order to prepare teachers for working with minorities in a positive and affirming manner;
- attention is paid to instruction in the home language and teachers are competent to do so;
- there are incentive programmes for teachers that acknowledge good practice in fostering inclusion;
- teachers' appraisals explicitly focus on efforts to promote inclusion;
- the teaching body reflects to some degree the composition of the student body.

To ensure an adequate supply of suitably qualified teachers from minority and indigenous communities, it is essential that higher education opportuni-

ties are available. Thus, a progressive education framework is one in which access to good-quality higher education, as well as primary and secondary education, is available to marginalized groups. Moreover, higher education is crucial to facilitate economic growth, to enhance innovative capacity, and to utilize and diffuse new technologies. More importantly, inequities between the rich and the poor are exacerbated at higher levels of education. Thus, effective strategies to overcome the marginalization of minorities and indigenous peoples in and through education require investment in all levels of education and not merely a narrow focus on primary and basic education.

Strategies to overcome marginalization

While there are no blueprints that can be transplanted from one context to another, there are a number of strategies which are worth considering in tackling marginalization. In general, most of the strategies are what could be classified as affirmative action or positive discrimination as they are interventions targeted for the benefit of particular groups. They are and should be, in theory, short-term strategies designed to leading to greater equality in society – a means to an end and not an end in themselves.

While there are many interventions which can be identified, there is not, as yet, sufficient rigorous and systematic research which documents the cost-effectiveness of these programmes and their impact on student learning. The major evaluations of voucher schemes, for example, show mixed evidence regarding their impact on learning, their cost in relation to benefits compared to other programmes, and the transaction cost.

For affirmative action interventions to be effective, they need to be well targeted, sustainable and cost effective. Tables 2–4 show a number of potential interventions, pointing out not only their benefits but also some of the adverse unintended outcomes. Moreover, it is important to recognize that the strategies should be interrelated. For example, strategies to overcome barriers to accessing school should also ensure that the school curriculum and procedures are made relevant and cater to the needs of the marginalized.

One set of strategies to overcome exclusion can be classified as demand-side interventions. These include, as Table 2 shows, incentives to include the

English, consequently, while it offered Xhosa as the second language, English was privileged throughout the school. At Oasis the approach taken was that English represented a commitment to 'standards'. At Basildon, as explained above, learners who were not English-proficient were either excluded or enrolled in lower classes.

The most extreme example of structured language exclusion happened at Ruby. Here Afrikaans ruled the roost in ways that were considered fairly unproblematic by the school. While some of the educators were ambiguous about the introduction of Xhosa, the school as a whole was inflexible in its privileging of Afrikaans. The case was the same with respect to English at Eastdale and Oasis.

The fact that most of the learners were not English mother tongue speakers made very little difference in each of the schools. Few of the schools made any efforts to use the learners' first languages in a formative and affirming way. Interestingly, this structured exclusion was a process in which 'African' parents, educators and learners were often complicit. At most of the schools, the parents made it clear

that speaking English properly was the major motivation for sending their children to these schools. It was often 'African' educators who were the subject of their complaints and 'African' educators whose teaching competence they doubted. Learners were themselves not innocent bystanders in these processes. 'African' educators complained about the ridicule to which 'African' learners subjected them because of the way in which they spoke English.

Teachers and teaching

Teachers are crucial to ensuring inclusion of marginalized learners at the classroom level. Policies need to address the professionalism and development of all staff, especially teaching staff. Most importantly, staff should demonstrate their commitment to a culture of inclusivity by ensuring that all students feel included in the classroom.

In the study of India we found that teachers had a deficit notion of the educational potential of marginalized minorities and indigenous peoples. They stated that Dalit and Adivasi children were 'not able to be educated', 'were not good at learning' and that

Table 2 Examples of incentives to include the marginalized

Special admissions policies	Lower admission requirements to educational institutions. A preferential university admission requirement for indigenous Fijians in Fiji increased access for the indigenous population. However, quality and performance were found to remain of great concern if indigenous students are to succeed in university.
Reservation schemes	Providing quotas for socially discriminated populations. In India, reserved seats for scheduled castes and scheduled tribes are provided in proportion to their population. The national average of reserved seats for such children is 22.5 per cent and some districts provide 50 per cent, according to government figures.
Scholarship, bursaries, or stipends	Providing scholarships, bursaries, or stipends. In Sierra Leone and Djibouti, researchers found that girls' scholarship programmes improved attendance and retention but created tension between the recipients and non-recipients who were equally qualified. More careful selection of recipients is necessary in order to reduce drop-outs and increase retention.
Reduce or eliminate direct costs of schooling	Abolishing school fees or providing school fee waivers. The government of Kenya abolished primary school fees in 2003. This led enrolments to increase by 1.3 million. However, a UNESCO study found that lack of facilities to accommodate children, overcrowded classrooms, a shortage of teachers, a lack of clear guidelines on admission, delay in disbursement of funds and expanded roles of head teachers were commonly observed.
Grants (conditional and unconditional, cash and in-kind)	Providing cash grants and supporting community-based efforts. The Bolsa Escola programme (merged in 2004 with other income-transfer programmes) in Brazil provided income support to poor families to encourage school attendance. A World Bank assessment found that although the programme was considered to be successful in general, questions remained over the way in which beneficiaries were identified and targeted, and its long-term sustainability.

marginalized by offering special admission policies or reservation schemes, or providing financial incentives such as scholarships, bursaries, stipends and grants.

Other possible interventions create alternative forms of education provision that cater to the specific needs of particular groups for whom conventional schooling models are inappropriate. Table 3 lists some supply-side interventions which focus on creating forms of schooling that are more relevant and appropriate to the needs of specific groups.

While it is important to increase the supply of education and boost demand, it is equally necessary, as noted earlier, to change the educational experiences of the marginalized in schools. Table 4 focuses on key teaching and learning interventions, includ-

ing school curricula, language policy and teacher training, which have the potential to enhance the relevance and quality of education that minorities and indigenous peoples receive.

Financing of education

Adequate domestic and international financing remains key to ensuring that there are effective policies and interventions to increase access to good-quality education for all, particularly the marginalized and disadvantaged. The Dakar Framework of Action is built on a promise that no government committed to education development will be 'thwarted by lack of resources'. Yet, the UNESCO 2009 global monitoring report estimates that of the US\$11 billion in development

Table 3 Examples of alternative forms of education provision

Second-chance education programmes	Providing bridging education for youth people and adults. The national governments in Indonesia and Thailand made legal provision for the right to education for all citizens. This enabled young people and adults to obtain basic education. A UNESCO study found that specific identification of targeted groups rather than the 'rural poor' is important for the success of the programme.
Provide relevant education for children in conflict or post-conflict	Offering programmes to meet the social and education needs of children and young people in post-conflict situations. Through a guidance and training programme called the Healing Classrooms Initiative (HCI) in northern Ethiopia, prospective teachers who had not completed secondary education gained confidence to become alternatively qualified teachers for children in camps. The HCI programme also offered the opportunity to complete and to continue further education. This programme demonstrated that there is potential to provide quality education in camps.
Provide appropriate education opportunities for disabled people	Offering education opportunities that respond to the needs of disabled people. The Inclusive Education Fund supported children with visual, hearing or mobility disabilities to access regular schools. The Uruguay experience demonstrated that, by supporting architectural improvements and training teachers to acquire knowledge and skills for the academic needs of all children in regular schools, the benefit of inclusive education went beyond those disabled children, promoting development of social, cognitive and emotional skills for all children and teachers in the programme school and contributing to the quality of education.
Private schooling	Allow communities to establish schools to empower and include marginalized communities in decision making. In recent years, India received a large influx of children previously denied access to education. Given financial constraints, the government of India allowed the private education sector to flourish and encouraged communities to participate, also addressing the 'upper-caste' hegemony of teaching positions by lowering educational qualifications to become a teacher. However, Sarada Balagopalan and Ramya Subrahmanian, writing for the Institute of Development Studies, cautioned that more low-fee private schools for Dalit and Adivasi children offer a low-quality education with fewer teaching materials and more unqualified teachers. If the reform intends to bring about inclusive education for all children, the government has to improve the quality of education, which is thus undermined.
Mobile schools	Offer mobile schools to those who are unable to reach conventional schools. Most people in North Eastern province in Kenya are pastoralist nomads. Girls in the area have very low school enrolments because they are often assigned to take livestock to a water point with their family, staying a few days before moving to another water point. In order to ensure schooling of girls as well as of boys in the area, the Ministry of Education established mobile schools near water points. Flexible timetables enabled schools to adjust to the nomadic lives. In Cebu City in the Philippines, the mobile school programme delivered by bus serves over 500 street children and other vulnerable children annually. (See Case Study, pp. 36–41.)

Table 3 Examples of alternative forms of education provision (Continued)

Community schools	Offer smaller community schools closer to home. Some girls in Pakistan's North-West Frontier Province attend community schools assisted by UNICEF. The number of public schools in the area is limited, and some children walk for up to three hours each way to attend school. Community schools help girls who could not otherwise receive primary education. In order to ensure the quality of education and the curriculum content, teachers must have a primary teaching certificate and a head teacher of the nearest public primary school visits the community school on a weekly basis.
-------------------	--

aid annually needed for low-income countries to achieve education for all, in 2006 only one-third of this was promised. This affects minorities and indigenous peoples, who are the most in need of special educational support but are also the hardest to reach. In Tanzania, aid to education supported the reduction of out-of-school children by 3 million since 1999. In Ethiopia, the government increased the budget allocation to education from 3.6 per cent of gross national product (GNP) in 1999 to 6 per cent in 2006. The number of out-of-school children decreased from 7 million to 3.7 million during the same period, and this would not be achieved without international assistance. Yet, despite promises made at Gleneagles in 2005, donors are still not forthcoming with aid, and almost US \$30 billion remains to be committed if the overall promise is to be met.

Worryingly, while education as a share of total official development assistance (ODA) remained constant at 9 per cent in 2006, basic education as a share of total aid to education slightly dropped to 45 per cent, compared with 48 per cent in 2004. Thus, more aid to basic education is important to ensure that the world keeps the promise of education for all by 2015.

Although more aid is a necessary condition, it is not a sufficient condition. Increased aid to education must be accompanied by aid which is predictable, harmonized and coordinated. Developing country governments should also improve the fairness and quality of education service delivery, and transparency and accountability, by tackling corruption.

Developing country governments can do much to increase resourcing for minorities and indigenous peoples. One general approach, which is not with-

out controversy, is to load the funding formula in favour of schools that attract such communities. In other words, additional financial resources accrue to schools which teach marginalized groups. There should also be conscious efforts to redirect the best teachers to schools serving minorities.

A further option would be to create a special policy reserve fund from the general exchequer for education programmes that favour the marginalized. Such a fund would pay for the kind of interventions discussed in the previous section. For such a fund to be effective there need to be clearly developed criteria and effective means of targeting and monitoring disbursement.

An obvious strategy is to remove school fees and not just tuition fees. However, free state provision of education seems to be the exception, with a majority of countries charging fees, in different forms. Of the 92 countries surveyed by Bentaouet and Burnett in a 2004 study for the World Bank, 83 per cent have some type of fee (whether legal or illegal). The majority of these countries (58 countries), including South Africa, charge legal fees which often take the form of tuition fees. As many as 33 countries supplement state income with informal types of school fees, such as Parent Teacher Association or community contributions. In sub-Saharan Africa, only three countries provide fully free primary education. The removal of fees (tuition and other charges) will have a positive effect on encouraging marginalized minorities to enrol.

Given the enormous inequalities in state expenditure during the *Apartheid* period, achieving equity in South Africa was always going to be a major challenge. Current reviews concur that there have been enormous gains in racial equity in terms of state expenditure per pupil. What is more contentious is

Table 4 Key teaching and learning interventions

Language	Introduce legislation on minority language instruction in school. Indigenous Sami people in Norway are guaranteed first-language education in and official status for the Sami languages. Until the seventh grade, parents have the choice of whether their children are taught in Sami or not. Local parents welcomed this and many Sami children learn in their mother tongue. Some Sami teacher training is done in Sami languages.
Curriculum	Develop a curriculum that integrates indigenous cultures. In Australia, there is funding for Aboriginal education through special programmes, although this has led to short-term solutions and Aboriginal education has come to be seen as not relevant to business. Consequently, despite improvement in educational outcomes of indigenous Australians in past decades, many indigenous students continue to drop out before Year 12. Poor education outcomes of indigenous students limit their access to further education as well as post-school options.
Teacher training and curriculum	Offer teacher trainees a curriculum that enhances awareness of multiculturalism. Intercultural Bilingual Education Teacher Training Programmes in Peru (AIDSESP/ISPL Programme) expose trainees to the different cultures that exist in Peru, enabling them to understand the needs and demands of indigenous peoples. Although the Ministry of Education welcomed the programme in teacher training colleges, in 1999 it adopted a new national competence-based curriculum for teacher training, which limited what could and could not be done in the intercultural bilingual education programme.
Teacher training and deployment	Give teachers incentives to teach in remote areas or recruit teachers from minority communities. In Uganda, a recent World Bank study on teacher attrition shows that the provision of housing to teachers who were posted in rural areas had a positive effect on teacher retention. In 2005, 15 per cent of the school facility grant was allocated to the construction of teacher housing. In Ghana, posting newly qualified teachers from the same college in pairs seems to work well, as does providing opportunities for study leave. In Laos, recruiting ethnic minorities into teacher training had some positive outcomes, although language barriers had to be overcome. In addition, not all students who graduated from training courses returned to their communities, due to marriage and other reasons.

the extent to which redress (or differential spending) has been achieved.

The primary interventions to achieve equity in education in South Africa include shifts in inter-provincial funding (the poorest provinces will receive more) and greater school allocations for the poorest pupils. The differential allocation is a significant departure from previous policy that focused on equalizing state per capita expenditure. It is an acknowledgement that the poor need greater support, but also that the *Apartheid* legacy of poverty remains.

The government of South Africa has also sought to use the principle of pro-poor financing in the funding of independent schools on condition that they provide quality education, combat racism and serve the poor. While such public funding of independent schools is fairly limited, it is very significant for lower-cost providers with a high intake of poorer children. The Department of Education recognized in 1998 that independent schools are cost-efficient for the state: 'if all learners were to transfer to public schools, the cost of public education in certain provinces might increase by as much as five per cent'.



Left: Women from the nomadic Hidareb minority who live on the arid plains of the Barka River, Kerkebet region, Eritrea. *Heldur Netocny/Panos.*

framework which has the needs of the marginalized at its centre, impressive rates of growth will not automatically benefit the poor. In adopting a holistic approach, it is also important to note that the marginalized are not a homogeneous group – the category of those classified as excluded reflects and refracts existing ethnic, class and gender differences and other inequities in society.

Third, there should be a participatory process involving all social groups and in particular those whom the policy is intended to benefit. Effective take-up rests on ownership by those for whom the policy is intended.

Fourth, policy mandates need to be coupled with strong political will and enhanced social awareness to ensure effective implementation and desirable outcomes. Thus communities need to be active in arguing for and being party to how inclusion policies unfold at all levels of the education system. In particular, attention needs to be paid to strengthening the ability of communities to hold schools accountable.

Effective implementation of policies

While the rhetorical value of many policies on inclusion is high, their potential for implementation remains precarious. In this regard strong efforts need to be made to establish mechanisms to support the implementation of policy and to ensure that there is much stronger correspondence between policy as pronounced and policy as practised. Implementing policy on inclusion should be the responsibility of all levels of the education system, right down to the level of school heads of department.

Effective implementation at the school level has already been described extensively in this chapter. Additionally, a key condition for ensuring implementation of policy is enhanced monitoring of exclusion. This needs to develop an expanded notion of inclusion beyond formal access to school, and should include monitoring the achievement of learners from marginalized and disadvantaged communities and disaggregating expenditure in terms of beneficiary analysis. Robust and appropriate monitoring means that policy remediation can occur. Effective monitoring also requires that an

appropriate system of incentives is in place at the institutional level to encourage schools to monitor the progress of the excluded.

Development agencies can and should play a key role in overcoming marginalization. There are a number of ways this could be done, including:

- ensuring that educational inclusion features prominently in sector reviews, development dialogues and other modalities of support;
- working with partner governments to ensure that social inclusion is planned for, budgeted and monitored;
- sharing and disseminating good practice on tackling social exclusion in education;
- encouraging constructive policy dialogue with NGOs;
- consolidating and aligning international efforts to tackle social exclusion in education;
- collecting data, reporting on progress and ensuring effective international monitoring and advocacy.

Overcoming the marginalization of minorities and indigenous peoples requires conscious policy choices where the goal is to enlarge the opportunities people have to develop and lead valued lives. For this to occur requires strong political will and capacity on the part of governments. It also requires an active and assertive civil society populated by organizations of the marginalized that champion their needs and hold governments to account. Overcoming discrimination and promoting inclusion in education are important goals in any society, but they are not ends in themselves. They are means to an end that is ultimately the fundamental transformation of society so that groups whose rights are most often denied can see their freedoms enlarged. ■

Policy lessons in overcoming marginalization

A number of lessons can be highlighted from research and experience in overcoming the exclusion of marginalized groups. The first relates to the dialectic between the universality of the right to education and the specificity of need and focus. In developing policies which are responsive to the needs of minorities and indigenous peoples, there is a need to move away from one-size-fits-all policies and instead develop those which recognize that individuals' social positions. A failure to understand the specificity of the problems can create perverse unintended outcomes. However, there is also simultaneously a need to retain a focus on 'universalism' or an integrated view of social equality. In education terms, the needs of minorities are in one way similar to those of all learners, that is, the need for good-quality education that is accessible, relevant, responsive and acceptable. Marginalized groups don't need, as the South African *Apartheid* system prior to 1994 poignantly illustrates, a segregated, separate and inferior second-chance education system. It is

important to develop context-specific policies that are tailored to specific needs while ensuring that differentiation does not drift into new forms of segregation. Thus, the key policy is to move towards an approach which ensures unity and equality through diversity.

Second, it is important to recognize that a more inclusive education system is a necessary but not a sufficient condition for ensuring that the rights of minorities and indigenous peoples are protected, promoted and advanced. What is also needed, as the experience of promoting gender equality reveals, is respect for the rights of minorities in society more widely. Greater synergy between education reform and societal transformation is crucial in developing a more coherent, holistic and joined-up approach to protecting and advancing the rights of minorities. For example, without the marginalized being able to meet basic needs such as health and housing, they have to trade off education against other needs. Without a policy which champions gender equality, girls and women will find it especially difficult to benefit from education. Without an economic